

WANDSWORTH BOROUGH COUNCILADULT CARE AND HEALTH OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE –  
12TH SEPTEMBER 2012

Report by the Director of Adult Social Services on the consultation on *Shaping a Healthier Future*, proposals for the reconfiguration of acute health care services in North West London

SUMMARY

The Clinical Commissioning Groups for North West London have issued a consultation document, *Shaping a Healthier Future*, on proposals for a reconfiguration of acute services in North West London. This bears many similarities to the parallel *Better Services, Better Value* proposals for the reconfiguration of acute services in South West London. The significance of *Shaping a Healthier Future* for Wandsworth is that 10-20% of Wandsworth residents using acute hospital services do so at the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital. Changes to acute services in North West London may also result in a flow of patients into hospitals in South West London. Whilst the preferred option put forward for consultation avoids these risks, the second option involves the downgrading of the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital to a 'local hospital', which would both remove a range of services popular with Wandsworth residents and would have a knock-on impact on St George's Hospital. The third option considered would involve a similar downgrading of the West Middlesex Hospital. Whilst this would not have a significant direct impact on Wandsworth residents, it would result in a significant additional flow of patients to Kingston Hospital, which is used by a large number of Wandsworth residents, particularly from the west of the Borough. It is doubtful whether Kingston Hospital would have the capacity to cope with this additional demand.

A Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee, on which Wandsworth is represented, has been established to evaluate and respond to consultation on the overall proposals being put forward under *Shaping a Healthier Future*. The response to consultation proposed in this report focusses specifically upon the impact of the proposals on Wandsworth residents. Accordingly, it is supportive of the preferred option and draws attention to the potentially adverse impact on Wandsworth residents of the two alternatives presented.

1. **Recommendations.** The Adult Care and Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee are recommended to agree the proposed response to consultation on *Shaping a Healthier Future* set out in Paragraph 14 below.
2. If the Overview and Scrutiny Committee approve any views, comments or additional recommendations on the report, these will be submitted to the Executive or to the relevant NHS body as appropriate for their consideration.

3. **Introduction.** On 2nd July the eight clinical commissioning groups covering North West London published a consultation document, *Shaping a Healthier Future*, setting out proposals for reconfiguration of acute services in their area. The summary of the consultation document is attached as the Appendix to this report. The deadline for responses to consultation is 8th October 2012.
4. **Proposals for consultation.** The rationale and the nature of proposals for service change is very similar to that being advanced through the *Better Services, Better Value* proposals covering South West London, with the case for change being both clinical and financial. The clinical case is that for certain critical functions of acute hospitals – accident and emergency, maternity and paediatric services – better outcomes are achieved with a high level of consultant cover at all times, including weekends. A reduction in the number of units is required if this is to be achieved. At the same time, there are activities currently undertaken in hospitals for which better outcomes and user experience could be achieved in primary care. The financial case for change is that the number of major hospitals in the area will become increasingly unaffordable, given the financial stringency facing the NHS, and that if planned action is not taken to rationalise services there will be a series of forced cuts which will be much more harmful.
5. The proposed model involves an overall shift of care out of hospital, with primary care being strengthened through additional investment and networking of GP services. Acute hospitals will be divided into two categories:
  - (a) local hospitals will provide urgent care centres, outpatient and diagnostic services, specialist clinics and rehabilitation services. Queen Mary's Hospital, Roehampton, is cited as an example of a local hospital;
  - (b) major hospitals will provide all of the above and will additionally offer accident and emergency services and trauma care, emergency surgery and intensive care, obstetrics and midwifery, and inpatient paediatrics.
6. In addition, it is proposed that there should be at least one elective care centre undertaking planned elective surgery. There are also some specialist hospitals in North West London, such as the Royal Brompton, the Royal Marsden and Harefield Hospital. These hospitals are largely unaffected by the proposals.
7. Of the nine hospitals in North West London, it is proposed that five will become major hospitals, three will be local hospital, and the Hammersmith Hospital, which is currently a general acute hospital with some specialist services, will become a specialist hospital. Under the various options, either one or two of the local hospitals will also provide an elective care centre.
8. It may be noted that the scale of change is much greater than that proposed in South West London, involving the closure of four accident and emergency departments rather than just one. However, the current level of acute hospital provision in North West London is much greater than in South West London: 1.76 acute hospital beds per 1,000 population, compared to 1.34. Even after the implementation of the changes, North West London will have one accident and emergency department per 395,000 population, compared with the one per 469,000 population proposed for South West London. The *Shaping a Healthier Future* proposals involve a commitment of £120 million to strengthen primary and community care services; the *Better Services, Better Value* proposals for South

west London do not make a similar commitment to investment in primary and community care.

9. *Shaping a Healthier Future* presents three possible options for the configuration of acute hospitals:
- (a) *Option A*, the preferred option, identifies St Mary's Hospital, the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital, the West Middlesex Hospital, Northwick Park Hospital and Hillingdon Hospital as major hospitals. Hammersmith Hospital would become a specialist hospital, and Charing Cross Hospital and Ealing Hospital would become local hospitals. The Central Middlesex Hospital would become both a local hospital and an elective care centre;
  - (b) Under *Option B* the major hospitals would be St. Mary's Hospital, Charing Cross Hospital, the West Middlesex Hospital, Northwick Park Hospital and Hillingdon Hospital. Hammersmith Hospital would become a specialist hospital, and the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital and Ealing Hospital would become local hospitals. As under Option A, the Central Middlesex Hospital would become both a local hospital and an elective care centre;
  - (c) Under *Option C* the major hospitals would be St Mary's Hospital, the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital, Ealing Hospital, Northwick Park Hospital and Hillingdon Hospital. Hammersmith Hospital would become a specialist hospital and Charing Cross Hospital would become a local hospital. Both the Central Middlesex Hospital and West Middlesex Hospital would become local hospitals with co-located elective care centres.
10. **Responding to consultation.** A Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee has been established to respond to consultation on *Shaping a Healthier Future*. Wandsworth Council has been invited to join this Committee, in view of the significant number of Wandsworth residents using hospital services within North West London and has nominated Cllr Mrs Usher and Cllr Mrs McDermott as its representatives. Whilst the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Overview and Scrutiny Committees within North West London will doubtless wish to take a view on the overall plans set out in *Shaping a Healthier Future*, the present paper focuses specifically upon the implications for Wandsworth residents. In practice, this means a focus on changes proposed for the hospitals used by Wandsworth residents and the possible interactions between the proposals in *Shaping a Healthier Future* and those in *Better Services, Better Value*.
11. **Use of North West London hospitals by Wandsworth residents.** Overall, in 2010/11, 16.1 % of elective day case activity for Wandsworth residents, 17.8% of elective inpatient activity, 22.6% of non-elective inpatient activity, and 14.8% of outpatient activity takes place in hospitals in North West London. In addition, in 2009/10, there were over 19,000 attendances at accident and emergency departments in North West London by Wandsworth residents. The following table breaks this data down to specific hospitals.

**TABLE: PROPORTION OF WANDSWORTH RESIDENTS USING DIFFERENT HOSPITALS IN NORTH WEST LONDON IN 2010/11**

Hospital	Elective day cases		Elective inpatient cases		Non-elective inpatient cases		Outpatient attendances		Accident and emergency attendances <sup>1</sup>
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.
Chelsea and Westminster	2,278	11.1	822	12.1	8,078	19.6	49,606	12.3	15,111
Charing Cross	508	2.5	203	3.0	806	2.0	5,697	1.4	3,260
Hammersmith	251	1.2	75	1.1	194	0.5	1,635	0.4	
St Mary's	152	0.7	83	1.2	131	0.3	1,940	0.5	
Other NW London Hospitals	95	0.5	26	0.4	129	0.3	938	0.2	698
<b>Total NW London</b>	<b>3,284</b>	<b>16.1</b>	<b>1,209</b>	<b>17.8</b>	<b>9,338</b>	<b>22.6</b>	<b>59,816</b>	<b>14.8</b>	<b>19,069</b>

**Note**

1. Accident and emergency data is for 2009/10 and is recorded at Trust level, rather than for specific hospitals

12. It will be seen that the Chelsea and Westminster is by far the most significant hospital for Wandsworth residents, being used by over 10% of Wandsworth residents attending hospital for elective procedures, and almost 20% of those attending for non-elective treatment. Charing Cross is the next most used hospital, but accounts for no more than 2-3% of the acute care for Wandsworth residents.
13. **Displacement of activity.** An alternative way of considering the potential impact of changes to acute services in North West London is to review the way in which activity would be displaced if hospitals presently categorised as acute were recategorised as local hospitals. Calculations of potential displacement are included in the pre-consultation business case which was published alongside the *Shaping a Healthier Future* consultation document. It is noted that a closure of services at two hospitals within North West London would be likely to result in a significant displacement of services to hospitals in South West London. One of these is the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital, from which 8% of activity would be displaced to St George's Hospital. A further 19% of activity from any service closed at the Chelsea and Westminster would be displaced to St Thomas's Hospital, which would include a high proportion of the hospital's usage by Battersea residents. The other hospital from which a loss of services would have a potentially significant impact on South West London is the West Middlesex Hospital. Although usage of the West Middlesex Hospital by Wandsworth residents is minimal, it is a major provider of acute care for Richmond residents and it is estimated that 21% of the activity displaced by the closure of services at this hospital would present at Kingston Hospital. Kingston Hospital is one of the hospitals most used by Wandsworth residents, especially those living in the west of the Borough.
14. **Proposed consultation response.** Taking into account the analysis presented above, it is proposed that the Overview and Scrutiny Committee should respond to consultation on *Shaping a Healthier Future* as follows:
  - (a) *Option A* does not appear to have any significant adverse impact on Wandsworth residents. Accordingly, the Overview and Scrutiny Committee has no objection to the implementation of this option, if it is judged by the clinical commissioning groups for North West London to be in the interests of North West London residents;

- (b) *Option B* would involve the loss of accident and emergency and maternity services, and of non-elective surgery at the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital. All of these services are used by a significant proportion of Wandsworth residents, and their loss would remove an option that many Wandsworth residents value. The displacement of activity to St George's Hospital would impose further pressure at St George's Hospital at a time when it will be expected to accommodate increased demands arising from the reconfiguration of services under the *Better Services, Better Value* proposals. The additional capacity proposed under *Better Services, Better Value* would be insufficient to cope with the extra flow of patients away from the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital. The Overview and Scrutiny Committee therefore opposes this option;
- (c) *Option C* would result in a substantial shift of patients away from the West Middlesex Hospital to Kingston Hospital. As Kingston Hospital is likely also to be facing additional demands arising from the reconfiguration of services under *Better Services, Better Value*, there may be questions as to whether it would have the capacity to cope with this additional influx of patients. The Overview and Scrutiny Committee therefore cautions against adoption of this option and, if it is pursued, requests that detailed consideration is given to ensuring that the additional capacity required at Kingston Hospital is made available.

15. **Conclusion.** *Shaping a Healthier Future* sets out proposals for acute healthcare services in North West London that bear many similarities to those being advanced through the *Better Services, Better Value* proposals in South West London. Its significance for Wandsworth residents lies in the fact that 10-20% of Wandsworth residents receiving hospital treatment do so in hospitals in North West London – principally the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital. There is also a risk that proposals from *Shaping a Healthier Future* may have an adverse impact on the proposed service model being put forward through *Better Services, Better Value*. A review of the options put forward under *Shaping a Healthier Future* suggests that the preferred option will not have any significant impact on Wandsworth residents or across South West London. However, the second option considered, which involves down-grading of the Chelsea and Westminster Hospital to a local hospital, would remove a range of services that are used by a significant proportion of Wandsworth residents and would result on additional demands on St George's Hospital at a time when it will be struggling to increase its capacity to meet the demands arising from *Better Services, Better Value*. The third option, under which the West Middlesex Hospital would become a local hospital and elective care centre, would not directly affect Wandsworth residents. However, the additional patient flow to the Kingston Hospital could exacerbate the challenges arising from the *Better Services, Better Value* reconfiguration, and it is unclear whether the hospital would have sufficient capacity to cope with the combined impact. For this reason, the recommended response from the Overview and Scrutiny Committee favours the preferred option and highlights the potential difficulties for Wandsworth residents entailed in the two other options on which consultation is taking place.

Town Hall  
Wandsworth SW18 2PU

DAWN WARWICK  
Director of Adult Social Services

4th September 2012

**Background papers**

The following background papers were considered in the preparation of this report:

Letter dated 27th April 2012 from Chief Executive of NHS North West London

Available from Dr. Richard Wiles (020 8871 6020) ([rwiles@wandsworth.gov.uk](mailto:rwiles@wandsworth.gov.uk))

All reports to the Overview and Scrutiny Committees, regulatory or other committees, the Executive and the full Council can be viewed on the Council's website

(<http://www.wandsworth.gov.uk/moderngov/uuCoverPage.asp?bcr=1>) unless the report

was published before May 2001, in which case the committee secretary

[jrichardson@wandsworth.gov.uk](mailto:jrichardson@wandsworth.gov.uk) (020-8871-6022) can supply it, if required.